# Email Correspondence Between RAID and PAMP 18 July 2019 to 03 July 2020

From: Anneke Van Woudenberg <	>
Date: Thursday, 18 July 2019 at 11:09 P	N
To: Arjun Raychaudhuri < >	
Cc: Rashmi Dastidar < >, Hit	esh Kalia <
Subject: Correspondence relating to Aca	icia Mining's North Mara mine in Tanzania

Dear Mr. Raychaudhuri,

I am writing to you to raise concerns about one of the mines from which MMTC-PAMP is sourcing gold. The mine in question is North Mara Gold Mine Ltd in Tanzania, owned by Acacia Mining Plc, a UK company. There are serious and ongoing human rights and environmental concerns at this mine which we believe merit your attention, especially in light of your company's commitment to the responsible sourcing of gold.

On 18 June 2019, the *Guardian* newspaper published an article entitled '<u>Tech firms to check</u> suppliers after mining revelations in Tanzania'. Your company was referred to in the article as sourcing gold from the North Mara mine and you issued a <u>public statement</u> on 28 June 2019 setting out your view on the human rights issues at the mine and inviting any additional information. We write in response to this invitation, both to provide additional information and to request a meeting with you and/or your team to discuss our research findings which we believe are relevant to your due diligence efforts.

RAID is a UK based non-governmental organization that exposes corporate abuses and human rights violations, partnering with those harmed to hold companies to account. RAID staff have visited the North Mara mine numerous times since 2014, including on four occasions in 2018/19. You will find further information in the attached letter.

My team and I would be very happy to meet with you and/or your staff to discuss our research findings, especially since we understand that your staff are currently organizing a visit to the North Mara mine. We can conduct such a meeting in person in London or via conference call at your earliest convenience.

I look forward to hearing from the team at MMCT-PAMP. Please do not hesitate to contact me if you have any questions. My contact details are below.

With my best regards,

Anneke Van Woudenberg

Anneke Van Woudenberg Executive Director Rights and Accountability in Development (RAID)

From: Hitesh Kalia < Determinant Sector Se

Dear Mrs Van Woudenberg,

Many thanks for your e-mail.

We very much welcome the opportunity for a conference call or a meeting, in order to hear any further clarification or additional information that we are unaware of. Basis the outcome of this discussion we will be happy to provide additional input to the independent expert and request clarification of the same.

As I am sure that you appreciate any discussion that we might have with you will be strictly confidential and we would request you that you do not disclose any information from these deliberations to anyone else without our prior written consent.

As the logistics of arranging a visit to India will take time and this matter is of a time sensitive nature, we would like to setup a conference call as soon as possible and suggest the following time slots for your consideration:

- Tuesday 23 July at 9 am or 10 am BST

- Friday 26 July at 9 am or 10 am BST

Looking forward to hearing from you as soon as possible.

Best Regards, Hitesh Kalia

From: Anneke Van Woudenberg < > Date: Monday, 22 July 2019 at 7:06 PM
To: Hitesh Kalia < > Cc: Rashmi Dastidar < > Arjun Raychaudhuri < > Subject: Re: Correspondence relating to Acacia Mining's North Mara mine in Tanzania

Dear Mr. Kalia,

We welcome the opportunity to speak with you on a conference call tomorrow at 9.30 BST.

In our experience, such conversations are best conducted in an open and transparent manner. We have raised our human rights concerns at the North Mara Mine repeatedly with Acacia Mining, its board of directors and its majority shareholder, and have published information in the public domain. From our side, there is therefore no need for the meeting to be confidential.

From your side, we fully understand that you may also wish to inform your customers, auditors and perhaps others, that you met with RAID who wished to share information relevant to your due diligence efforts. As you will know, the OECD Due Diligence Guidance for Responsible Mineral Supply Chains specifically sets out the importance of reaching out to civil society organizations, community networks and affected third parties. In turn, we have no objection to you referring to our meeting and to you sharing information from our call with others. With this in mind, I hope you will agree to conduct our meeting transparently. If during the call, you assess that a particular bit of information might be relevant to share, but can only be done under "strict confidentiality," then we can agree to that on a case-by-case basis. Please allow me to assure that this is the normal manner in which we conduct such meetings which has proven to be effective in the past.

I look forward to speaking tomorrow. Please let us know the number we can use for our conference call.

With my best regards, Anneke Van Woudenberg

Anneke Van Woudenberg Executive Director Rights and Accountability in Development (RAID)

From: Hitesh Kalia < Description</li>
Date: Tuesday, 23 July 2019 at 06:39
To: Anneke Van Woudenberg < Description</li>
Subject: Re: Correspondence relating to Acacia Mining's North Mara mine in Tanzania

Dear Anneke,

We confirm the call at 9:30 BST. Tell me if the skype call invite suits you else I will share the teleconference details.

Thanks Hltesh

From: Anneke Van Woudenberg < Source Source

Subject: Re: Correspondence relating to Acacia Mining's North Mara mine in Tanzania

Dear Hitesh, Olivier and Jaqueline,

Thank you for the call yesterday to discuss the human rights concerns at Acacia Mining's North Mara mine. I hope it was helpful to your due diligence efforts.

As discussed, we would welcome an opportunity to brief the independent expert you will be engaging and to provide further details on our research. We would be grateful if you could let us know when the expert has been appointed.

You also promised to get back to us on the date when you first began to conduct due diligence on Acacia's North Mara mine. I look forward to hearing back from you on that.

On the call you had some pertinent questions about why there are so many intrusions at the North Mara mine. We discussed some of the context of gold mining in the North Mara region, but I thought you might also find it helpful to have a few more details. You will find attached a short 2-page document that gives you a bit more background and links to relevant documents.

Do please get back to us with any further questions.

Best regards,

Anneke

Anneke Van Woudenberg Executive Director Rights and Accountability in Development (RAID)

From: Hitesh Kalia < Description > Date: 27 July 2019 at 04:20:28 CEST To: Anneke Van Woudenberg < Description > Cc: Olivier Demierre < Description >, " Description = > Subject: Re: Correspondence relating to Acacia Mining's North Mara mine in Tanzania

Dear Anneke,

Thank you very much for your input on the mine that was much appreciated.

As discussed, MMTC-PAMP performs enhanced due diligence on every mine before entering into a new commercial relationship and monitors it on an on-going basis, including reviewing third party assessment such as the World Gold Council Conflict Free gold report. Our due diligence are performed in compliance with the LBMA Responsible Gold Guidance, including the on site visit. The LBMA Responsible Gold Guidance is the industry program to comply with the OECD Due diligence guidance for responsible supply chains of minerals from conflict affected and high risk areas. We are independently audited annually for our compliance with the LBMA Responsible Gold Guidance.

Thanks Hitesh Kalia

From: Anneke Van Woudenberg < Constraints > Date: Monday, 23 September 2019 at 7:44 PM
To: Hitesh Kalia < Constraints >, Olivier Demierre < Constraints >, "Constraints > "

Subject: Re: Correspondence relating to Acacia Mining's North Mara mine in Tanzania

Dear Hitesh, Olivier and Jaqueline,

I am following-up after our phone call over the summer to ask if MMTC-Pamp has yet appointed the independent expert. As we discussed, RAID would welcome the opportunity to present our findings to the independent expert and to discuss our concerns about North Mara mine with him/her. I trust the expert will consult broadly, including with civil society. As such I expect our views and those of other civil groups who have regularly visited North Mara and raised human rights and environmental concerns will be of interest.

Would be grateful if you could let us know how we might be in touch with the independent expert.

With my best regards,

Anneke

Anneke Van Woudenberg Executive Director Rights and Accountability in Development (RAID)

**Cc:** Olivier Demierre < >, "**Constant of** >, "**Subject:** Re: Correspondence relating to Acacia Mining's North Mara mine in Tanzania

Dear Anneke,

Thank you for your email.

We have worked with the mine since our discussion in order to implement the independent expert assessment we have discussed with you.

This process took time, even more so because of the planned acquisition by Barrick of the Acacia shares it did not already own, the same becoming effective and the consequent changes in management responsibilities. Now that these changes have essentially been completed, we hope to be able to conclude such process soon.

As to your point on the expert consultation, please note it has been set broadly. We anticipate as a result that the expert will want to contact you early on, during its assessment

Regards, Hitesh

From: Anneke Van Woudenberg < 2000 > Date: Tuesday, 24 September 2019 at 11:02 PM To: Hitesh Kalia < 2000 > Cc: Olivier Demierre < 2000 >, "2000 0 \* Compared \* Compa

Subject: Re: Correspondence relating to Acacia Mining's North Mara mine in Tanzania

Thank you Hitesh for your quick reply. It would be helpful to know who the independent is and when we can expect to be contacted?

All the best, Anneke

From: Hitesh Kalia < Decision > Date: Tuesday, 1 October 2019 at 23:10 To: Anneke Van Woudenberg < Decision > Subject: Re: Correspondence relating to Acacia Mining's North Mara mine in Tanzania

Dear Anneke,

Understood.

We will let you know the name of the independent expert and its confirmed dates of intervention when we have them.

Regards, Hitesh

From: Anneke Van Woudenberg < Date: Tuesday, 15 October 2019 at 11:00 PM To: Hitesh Kalia < Cc: Olivier Demierre <

Subject: Re: Correspondence relating to Acacia Mining's North Mara mine in Tanzania

Hi Hitesh,

Just looping back to check if there has been any progress on appointing an independent expert and if you have any dates for when this assessment will be conducted.

Best regards,
Anneke
From: Hitesh Kalia <>
Date: Thursday, 17 October 2019 at 03:49
<b>To:</b> Anneke Van Woudenberg <
Cc: Olivier Demierre < >
Subject: Re: Correspondence relating to Acacia Mining's North Mara mine in Tanzania

Dear Anneke,

Thanks for getting back to us.

Please note we have a tentative time for the on the ground assessment : the week of November 18<sup>th</sup>. Logistics arrangements are in the process of being confirmed. When they are, we shall confirm the expert.

Regards, Hitesh

From: Anneke Van Woudenberg < Date: Thursday, 17 October 2019 at 8:03 PM To: Hitesh Kalia < **Cc:** Olivier Demierre < Sector Subject: Re: Correspondence relating to Acacia Mining's North Mara mine in Tanzania

Dear Hitesh,

Thank you for the information. I would be grateful if you could confirm who the independent expert will be and his/her terms of reference as soon as possible. As mentioned previously, we are keen to engage with the expert on our concerns and see what steps we can take to help facilitate contact with local civil society groups and victims, something which I expect will be crucial to the expert's work.

With my best regards, Anneke

From: Hitesh Kalia < Decision Composition > Date: Friday, 18 October 2019 at 09:36 To: Anneke Van Woudenberg < Decision Composition > Cc: Olivier Demierre < Decision > Subject: Re: Correspondence relating to Acacia Mining's North Mara mine in Tanzania

Dear Anneke,

Thank you for your email.

We shall notify the independent expert as soon as they are confirmed of your interest in talking to them.

Best Regards, Hitesh

From: Anneke Van Woudenberg < Date: Wednesday, 23 October 2019 at 15:34 To: Hitesh Kalia < Cc: Olivier Demierre <

Subject: Re: Correspondence relating to Acacia Mining's North Mara mine in Tanzania

Hi Hitesh,

Has there been any progress on the appointment of the independent expert? Also, are the dates of November 18 in Tanzania now confirmed?

All the best, Anneke

From: Anneke Van Woudenberg <</td>Date: Tuesday, 29 October 2019 at 9:06 PMTo: Hitesh Kalia Cc: Olivier Demierre >

Subject: Re: Correspondence relating to Acacia Mining's North Mara mine in Tanzania

Hi Hitesh,

Sorry to be chasing you but am very conscious that the week of November 18<sup>th</sup> is just around the corner for the possible visit of the independent expert to North Mara. Setting up contact with civil society will require a bit of time to prepare. Could you please confirm if this is still going ahead and the name of the independent expert?

All the best, Anneke

From: Hitesh Kalia <	
Date: Wednesday, 30 October 2019	at 15:03
<b>To:</b> Anneke Van Woudenberg <	>
Cc: Olivier Demierre < >	
Subject: Re: Correspondence relating	g to Acacia Mining's North Mara mine in Tanzania

Dear Anneke,

Thank you for your renewed interest in the expert assessment.

We are still organising with the mine and the potential consultant with the view to have the assessment happen on the ground the week starting November 18<sup>th</sup>.

As mentioned earlier, we shall notify the independent expert as soon as they are confirmed of your interest in talking to them. Do you want us by the way to as well provide them the attached document that you sent to us?

Thanks Hitesh

From: Anneke Van Woudenberg < > > Date: Wednesday, 6 November 2019 at 3:15 PM To: Hitesh Kalia < > > Cc: Olivier Demierre < > >

Subject: Re: Correspondence relating to Acacia Mining's North Mara mine in Tanzania

Dear Hitesh,

Is there any further information on the appointment of the independent expert? RAID will have a staff member in North Mara (Tanzania) the week of November 18<sup>th</sup> to meet with the expert and, if conditions are appropriate, to facilitate contact between the expert and local community groups. We will require contact details for how to get in touch with him/her. Might you now be in a position to provide these?

In terms of documents, there are a considerable number of reports, press releases and letters to Acacia's management and Acacia Mining's board of directors which will be relevant for the independent expert. You may recall that we sent a full list of key documents as an annex to RAID's letter of 19 July 2019. I attach the annex again to this email so it can be passed on to the expert.

I look forward to hearing from you.

Best regards, Anneke

From: Hitesh Kalia < \_\_\_\_\_ > Date: Thursday, 7 November 2019 at 15:00
To: Anneke Van Woudenberg < \_\_\_\_\_ > Cc: Olivier Demierre < \_\_\_\_\_ > Subject: Re: Correspondence relating to Acacia Mining's North Mara mine in Tanzania

Dear Anneke,

MMTC-PAMP has appointed yesterday Synergy Global as independent expert for the assessment of the mine. The on the ground work will take place during the week of November 18<sup>th</sup>.

We have transmitted to Synergy Global your details, the two documents you have provided to us and the information below.

Thank You Hitesh From: Anneke Van Woudenberg < 2000 > Date: Saturday, 9 November 2019 at 6:43 PM To: Hitesh Kalia < 2000 > Cc: Olivier Demierre < 2000 >

Subject: Re: Correspondence relating to Acacia Mining's North Mara mine in Tanzania

Thank you Hitesh. Would be grateful if you could also share the terms of reference for the independent assessment.

All the best, Anneke

From: Hitesh Kalia < > > Date: Monday, 11 November 2019 at 16:57 To: Anneke Van Woudenberg < C: Olivier Demierre < > >

Subject: Re: Correspondence relating to Acacia Mining's North Mara mine in Tanzania

Dear Anneke,

This information is not supposed to be for public review and hence cannot be shared.

Thank You Hitesh

From: Anneke Van Woudenberg < Constraints > Date: Tuesday, 12 November 2019 at 12:11 AM To: Hitesh Kalia < Constraints > Cc: Olivier Demierre < Constraints > Subject: Re: Correspondence relating to Acacia Mining's North Mara mine in Tanzania

Dear Hitesh,

It will be difficult to know how to structure our engagement with the independent expert if we do not know the terms of reference. For example, what information on human rights and the environment will the expert be seeking to collect? From which sources will the expert be seeking this information? Will the expert engage with local communities? If yes, how? Can the expert gather information in an independent fashion, without the presence of mining company officials? Will the final report be public?

As you may know, transparency is a key component of the UN Guiding Principles on Business and Human Rights, as well as the OECD Due Diligence Guidance for Responsible Supply Chains of Minerals from Conflict-Affected and High-Risk Areas. Sharing the TORs for the assessment will provide much greater confidence that this exercise will be thorough and truly independent. I assume this is of paramount importance to MMTC-PAMP and your customers. In that regard, I hope you might re-consider publishing this information.

Finally, will someone from MMTC-PAMP be joining the expert on the assessment? If yes, we would welcome meeting the MMTC-PAMP representative as well during the visit.

Best regards, Anneke

From: Hitesh Kalia < > Date: Thursday, 14 November 2019 at 06:21
To: Anneke Van Woudenberg < > Cc: Olivier Demierre < >, Jay Schnyder < > Subject: Re: Correspondence relating to Acacia Mining's North Mara mine in Tanzania

Dear Anneke,

The ToR were established in collaboration between the independent expert, the mine, the LBMA and us. It is not a public document to start with, so it cannot be shared as a result. The final report by the expert will be discussed by the parties involved, and the outcomes will be made public.

As to your kind offer to meet on the ground in Tanzania, MMTC-PAMP's representative (Jay Schnyder, in cc) is happy to meet with yours on the ground if it is practically possible during his short time there.

Kind regards, Hitesh

From: Anneke Van Wou	idenberg < >		
Date: Saturday, 16 Nove	ember 2019 at 4:34 PM		
<b>To:</b> Hitesh Kalia <	>		
Cc: Ed O'Keefe <	>, Michael Elliot <	>, Olivier Demierre <	>
Subject: Meeting betwe	een RAID and Synergy Global i	n North Mara	

Dear Hitesh,

As you know, a RAID team member will be in North Mara this coming week to meet with the independent expert from Synergy Global. We have been in touch with Ed from Synergy Global (copied here) who informs us that it will be MMTC-Pamp who will organise the meeting. Please can you let us know when and where this meeting will take place?

I must admit that we find the situation perplexing since we have been I touch with you since June expressing our interest to meet with the independent expert. We are now just days before the visit is due to take place and no meeting time or place has yet been fixed. We have also offered repeatedly to put the independent expert in touch with local victims and/or their families so he/she can get the broadest view possible of the human rights situation. This will take some time to organise, including the modalities of the meeting. We remain open to be of assistance, but I must stress that time is running short.

As mentioned in previous correspondence, broad and genuine consultation with civil society, local community members and victims is required for an independent assessment to be truly "independent". If the assessment to be conducted by Synergy Global is only to speak with the company or company selected groups/individuals then it will not pass that test and will not meet the public commitment made by MMTC-PAMP to independently assess the human rights situation at the North Mara Mine.

I trust this is not your intention and I very much hope we can organise the meetings in North Mara this week with the independent expert.

Best regards, Anneke

Anneke Van Woudenberg Executive Director Rights and Accountability in Development (RAID)

From: Hitesh Kalia < > Date: Sunday, 17 November 2019 at 16:42
To: Anneke Van Woudenberg < > Cc: Ed O'Keefe < > Michael Elliot < > Subject: Re: Meeting between RAID and Synergy Global in North Mara

Dear Anneke,

Thank you for your e-mail.

Please note that there are no restrictions put on Synergy to meet with anyone and they are free to engage with RAID or anyone else for that matter. However, due to the sensitivities of the situation and as Barrick are organising the logistics of the visit and getting the audit team to site and they are therefore responsible for their safety and well-being throughout the visit, they do not feel comfortable to take responsibility for the safety and well-being of the Synergy team during meetings that have been organised by 3<sup>rd</sup> parties in the community.

Therefore, whilst Synergy will not be able to meet with your team member in North Mara next week, they will contact you to agree on a mutually convenient time to talk.

Best regards, Hitesh From: Anneke Van Woudenberg < Date: Monday, 18 November 2019 at 4:18 PM To: Hitesh Kalia < > Cc: Ed O'Keefe < >, Michael Elliot < >, Jay Schnyder < Subject: Re: Meeting between RAID and Synergy Global in North Mara

Dear Hitesh,

It will be extremely challenging for Synergy Global to independently assess the human rights situation at the North Mara mine if they are unable to meet with local community members in some kind of neutral environment. I must stress once again, that broad and genuine consultation with civil society, local community members and victims is required for an independent assessment to be truly "independent". I hope you will insist with Barrick that this is crucial benchmark for MMTC-PAMP to meet the commitment you made publicly to conduct an independent assessment of the human rights situation at the North Mara mine. Failure to do so risks this assessment being one-sided, with Mine officials controlling what and who the Independent Expert sees. Surely this is not in anyone's interest.

My colleague, Michael Elliot, who is in North Mara will be happy to have an initial meeting with Synergy Global at the mine's offices in North Mara which are on the mine's premises as well as with the PAMP representative, Jay Schnyder, copied on this message. This will therefore avoid any concerns about security.

We believe there may be some victims/community representatives who might be willing to come to the mine's offices to directly express their concerns to Synergy Global, though we will need to confirm this with them. Michael can discuss this further with the Synergy Global team during their meeting and the modalities of how such a meeting might be organized.

Do please let us know what time Synergy Global and Jay Schnyder will be available to meet this week.

Best regards,

Anneke

From: Hitesh Kalia < > > Date: Monday, 18 November 2019 at 15:21
To: Anneke Van Woudenberg < > > Cc: Ed O'Keefe < > , Michael Elliot < > , Jay Schnyder < > > Subject: Re: Meeting between RAID and Synergy Global in North Mara

Dear Anneke,

Thank you for your message.

We don't think that a meeting at Barrick's offices would be appropriate as it is not a neutral environment. In any case, we have already finalised the planning for the visit, which is already very dense. Unfortunately, no additional meeting could be arranged during the day we are on site without compromising the planning. Therefore, Synergy will coordinate directly with you to make alternative arrangements for a meeting.

Regarding Jay, unfortunately, his travel plan has just been changed and he may not be able to meet with you this week, as initially planned. He will contact you at a later time.

We hope that you understand the situation.

Best	Regards,
Hites	sh

From: Anneke Van Wo	udenberg <>		
Date: Wednesday, 20 N	lovember 2019 at 6:54 PM		
To: Hitesh Kalia <	>		
Cc: Ed O'Keefe <	>, Michael Elliot <	>, Jay Schnyder <	>
Subject: Re: Meeting b	etween RAID and Synergy Glol	bal in North Mara	

Dear Hitesh,

I must say that this is disappointing and surprising.

We have been in touch with you since July 2019 and repeatedly expressed our interest in meeting with the independent expert to share our research findings. We have also repeatedly offered to put the independent expert in touch with victims and local communities who can provide further information about the human rights situation and their experiences with the mine. We have arranged to be on the ground in North Mara to help facilitate such meetings, if required, and to provide opportunities for the independent expert to collect a broad range of information about the human rights situation. The fact that no time has been allocated for such meetings sends a strong impression that MMTC-PAMP is not interested in collecting this information or is being blocked by Mine officials from doing so. This troubling and risks seriously undermining the public commitment made by MMTC-PAMP.

If I am wrong about this and meetings with victims have been arranged, do please let me know. It would be helpful to know which and how many community groups and local representatives Synergy Global will be meeting with and whether these are groups/individuals have been identified by the Mine.

Your note says that the Synergy Global will only be on the mine site for one day. Is that correct? Will they be spending any time in the local communities around the Mine?

Just for the record, RAID has no concerns meeting with Synergy Global or Jay at the mine site, which is why we offered it. We have regularly communicated our concerns about human rights to Acacia Mining (now Twiga Mineral) and Barrick Gold.

In any case, since a meeting between RAID and Synergy Global will now not take place in North Mara, we will be happy to meet with Ed O'Keefe in the UK.

Please let me know when we can meet with Jay.

Best regards,

۸r	ne	ka
AI	me	ке

From: Hitesh Kalia <	
Date: Thursday, 21 November 2019 at 18:38	
To: Anneke Van Woudenberg <	
Cc: Ed O'Keefe < >, Michael Elliot < >, Jay Schny	/der < >
Subject: Re: Meeting between RAID and Synergy Global in North Mara	

Dear Anneke,

Thank you for your e-mail.

While we note your disappointment that we could not accommodate all your specific requests, please note that we have at this stage:

- initiated and coordinated an independent assessment of the mine
- given you the possibility to provide your input on the situation at the mine
- kept you abreast of the planning of the assessment
- introduced you to Synergy
- proposed a meeting between RAID and Synergy
- proposed a meeting between RAID and Jay.

Furthermore, please note that meetings with the community are an integral part of the independent assessment.

As already mentioned, Synergy and Jay will contact you so that you can provide them with your first hand input on the situation at the mine.

Best Regards, Hitesh

From: Anneke Van Woude	nberg <		
Date: Friday, 22 Novembe	r 2019 at 4:40 PM		
To: Hitesh Kalia <	>		
<b>Cc:</b> Ed O'Keefe <	>, Michael Elliot <	>, Jay Schnyder <	>
Subject: Re: Meeting betw	veen RAID and Synergy Glol	bal in North Mara	

Dear Hitesh,

I look forward to meeting with Jay and Synergy Global. I am pleased to hear that meetings with the local community are an integral part of the assessment. Could you please let us know which groups the expert has meet with in North Mara/or will be meeting with?

I would like to take the opportunity just to quickly respond to your other points which I think are not a fair reflection of our communication to date.

You say that you "could not accommodate all [our] specific requests", but our requests have not been numerous. In fact, there have been two: (1) a meeting between RAID and the independent expert, and (2) for the expert to meet with victims and local community groups in broad and genuine consultations. I trust you agree these are reasonable and should, in any case, be central to the work of any independent assessment on human rights.

We have further urged you to be transparent on how the assessment will be conducted, including publishing the TORs, in order to meet the transparency requirements set out under the UN Guiding Principles on Business and Human Rights and the OECD Due Diligence Guidance for Responsible Supply Chains.

On your other points, in relation to actions taken by MMTC-PAMP:

#### - initiated and coordinated an independent assessment of the mine

We are pleased that MMTC-PAMP has initiated an independent assessment, though as expressed in our recent correspondence, we are troubled that some basic requirements for the assessment to be independent are being compromised.

#### - given you the possibility to provide your input on the situation at the mine

We have not yet had any opportunity to provide input to the independent expert, despite numerous requests. We have offered to meet anytime this week at the mine site in North Mara but this was not planned in the schedule. As far as we are aware, meetings with human rights victims have also not yet taken place. We look forward to meeting the expert in London and hope a date will be fixed soon. We await the response to our proposed dates.

## - kept you abreast of the planning of the assessment

Please note that information we have received to date has been in response to repeated reminders via email sent by us since July. The information about the appointment of Synergy Global was communicated to us on November 7, just ahead of the dates for the assessment.

## - introduced you to Synergy

MMTC-PAMP did not introduce us to Synergy Global. RAID reached out to them independently.

## - proposed a meeting between RAID and Synergy

As you will see from our correspondence, it was RAID who repeatedly expressed our desire to meet with the independent expert. MMTC-PAMP informed us that you would transmit our request.

#### - proposed a meeting between RAID and Jay.

It was RAID who offered to meet with Jay when we learned he too would be in North Mara at the same time as a member of our team. Unfortunately, this was not scheduled into the visit, though we welcome the opportunity to meet with Jay in the future and look forward to having a firm date for the meeting.

With my best regards,

Anneke
From: Hitesh Kalia < Constant Solution
Date: 26 November 2019 at 11:07:55 CET
To: Anneke Van Woudenberg < Constant Solution
Cc: Ed O'Keefe < Constant Solution
>, Michael Elliot < Constant Solution
>, Jay Schnyder < Constant Solution
> Subject: Re: Meeting between RAID and Synergy Global in North Mara

Dear Anneke,

Thank you for your input of which we take note.

As to the status of the various engagements, Synergy is continuing to do their independent assessment and will report back to us in due course.

Best regards, Hitesh

From: Anneke Van Woudenb	erg < >	
Date: Wednesday, 12 Februa	ary 2020 at 5:56 PM	
<b>To:</b> Hitesh Kalia <	>	
<b>Cc:</b> Olivier Demierre <	>, Jay Schnyder <	>
Subject: Report from Indepe	ndent Expert on the North Ma	ara mine

Dear Hitesh,

I am following up on our correspondence from last year in relation to the independent expert that MMTC-PAMP engaged to review matters concerning human rights and the environment at the North Mara Gold mine in Tanzania.

In our previous communication you said that the outcomes of the assessment would be made public. It has now been a few months since the assessment was completed. I would be grateful if you could let me know when you anticipate publishing the outcomes.

Kind regards,

Anneke

Anneke Van Woudenberg Executive Director

**Rights and Accountability in Development (RAID)** <u>www.raid-uk.org</u> | Twitter: <u>@raidukorg</u>

Dear Anneke,

Thank you for following up on this.

The reporting process is ongoing. We hope the expert will soon be in a position to issue the detailed report.

When this is done, we shall consider if and how we can make the related outcomes public.

Kind regards

Hitesh

From: Anneke Van Woudenberg <	>	
Subject: Correspondence from RAID on Nor	h Mara Gold Mine	
Date: May 15, 2020 at 6:07:40 PM GMT+1		
To: Olivier Demierre <		
Cc: Hitesh Kalia < >, <	>, "'Tom Kenny'" <	>, Michael Elliot
<		

Dear Olivier,

I hope you and the team at PAMP are well during these challenging times.

As some time has elapsed since we last heard from PAMP, I am reaching out to continue the dialogue we began in July 2019 concerning human rights violations at the North Mara gold mine in Tanzania. Please find attached correspondence from RAID which provides further explanation.

I look forward to your response.

With my best regards,

Anneke

## Anneke Van Woudenberg

**Executive Director** 

From: Olivier Demierro	e <>		
Date: Monday, 25 May	y 2020 at 14:12		
To: Anneke Van Woud	enberg < >		
Cc: Hitesh Kalia <	>, 'Tom Kenny' <	>, Michael Elliot <	> <i>,</i> Jay
Schnyder <	>, Jacqueline MayorMeylan <	>	
Subject: Re: Correspon	ndence from RAID on North Mara	Gold Mine	

Dear Anneke,

Thank you for your letter below.

I propose to have a conference call on Friday at 10 am Swiss time with Jay, Jacqueline, Hitesh and myself to have the discussion you ask for in your letter.

Would this time be convenient to you ?

We shall answer your letter in writing after that.

Thanks and kind regards,

OLIVIER DEMIERRE MKS (Switzerland) SA

From: Anneke Van Wo	udenberg <		
Sent: mardi, 26 mai 202	20 18:12		
To: Olivier Demierre <	>		
Cc: Hitesh Kalia <	>; 'Tom Kenny' <	>; Michael Elliot <	>; Jay
Schnyder <	>; Jacqueline MayorMeylan <	>	
Subject: Re: Correspon	dence from RAID on North Mara	Gold Mine	

Dear Olivier,

Thank you for getting back to me. Unfortunately, Friday morning does not work from our side due to a conflicting meeting. But we could do Thursday morning, May 28, or next week Tuesday morning, June 2, at 10 am Swiss time. Might either of those work for you?

Best regards,

Anneke

From: Olivier Demierr	re < >		
Date: Wednesday, 27	May 2020 at 08:05		
To: Anneke Van Woud	denberg <>		
Cc: Hitesh Kalia <	>, 'Tom Kenny' <	>, Michael Elliot <	>, Jay
Schnyder <	>, Jacqueline MayorMeylan <	>	
Subject: RE: Correspo	ndence from RAID on North Mara	Gold Mine	
Dear Anneke,			

This is fine. Can we then say Tuesday June 2 at 10 am Swiss time ?

Thanks and kind regards,

Olivier

From: Anneke Van Wo	udenberg <>		
Sent: mercredi, 27 mai	2020 13:09		
To: Olivier Demierre <	>		
Cc: Hitesh Kalia <	>; 'Tom Kenny' <	>; Michael Elliot <	>; Jay
Schnyder <	>; Jacqueline MayorMeylan <	>	
Subject: Re: Correspon	dence from RAID on North Mara	Gold Mine	

Yes – Tuesday June 2 at 10 am Swiss time/9 am UK time works from our side.

Do please let us know the call-in details when you have them.

Best, Anneke

From: Anneke Van Wo	udenberg <		
Sent: lundi, 1 juin 2020	) 17:14		
To: Olivier Demierre <	>		
Cc: Hitesh Kalia <	>; 'Tom Kenny' <	>; Michael Elliot <	>; Jay
Schnyder <	>; Jacqueline MayorMeylan <	>	
Subject: Re: Correspon	dence from RAID on North Mara (	Gold Mine	

Dear Olivier and colleagues,

We look forward to the discussion tomorrow. I assume our discussion will be on the same basis as the one we held last year - that is, on-the-record and moving to confidential if an issue is flagged by you as commercially sensitive.

Would be most grateful if you could confirm this.

All the best, Anneke

From: Olivier Demierre <>	
Date: Tuesday, 2 June 2020 at 08:59	
To: Anneke Van Woudenberg < >>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>	
Cc: Hitesh Kalia <>, 'Tom Kenny' <	>, Michael Elliot <>, Jay

Schnyder < , Jacqueline MayorMeylan < Schwarzer > Subject: RE: Correspondence from RAID on North Mara Gold Mine

Dear Anneke,

Thank you for this.

Please kindly note that the conversation will be **confidential**.

Talk to you soon,

Kind regards,

Olivier

Note: The above email was received 1 minute before the RAID-PAMP meeting was due to start. RAID urged for transparency on the phone call, saying this was RAID's strong preference and best practice for such discussions. PAMP refused to proceed unless the information it shared with RAID during the discussion was kept confidential. PAMP stated that it would respond to RAID in writing with answers to previous correspondence. Before RAID agreed to the confidentiality, PAMP said it regarded RAID as "interfering" in the process. RAID stressed its concerns about lack of transparency.

From: Olivier Demierre <>	
Subject: RE: Correspondence from RAID on North Mara Gold Mine	
Date: July 7, 2020 at 2:55:52 PM GMT+1	
<b>To:</b> Anneke Van Woudenberg <>	
Cc: Hitesh Kalia <>, "'Tom Kenny''' <>, Michael Elliot <	>,
Jacqueline MayorMeylan <	

Dear Anneke,

Thank you for your letter dated May 15th and your interest in MMTC-PAMP's due diligence of the North Mara Gold Mine ("NMGM"), as well as our phone conversation on June 2<sup>nd</sup> including Jay Schnyder, Jacqueline Mayor Meylan and myself. As mentioned at the time, we needed to complete our reporting process before responding to your letter.

As you know, MMTC-PAMP takes allegations regarding any environmental and human-rights abuses extremely seriously.

MMTC-PAMP performs enhanced due diligence on every supply chain before entering into a new commercial relationship and rigorously follows the London Bullion Market Association's (LBMA) Responsible Gold/Silver guidance, which is the industry program to comply with the OECD Due

Diligence Guidance for Responsible Supply Chains of Minerals from Conflict-Affected and High-Risk Areas (OECD Guidance).

Furthermore, the MKS PAMP GROUP proactively and fully supports the LBMA's effort in enhancing the reporting standards applied by the refiners.

Following Barrick's take-over of Acacia Mining in September 2019, MMTC-PAMP has transitioned its relationship to North Mara Gold Mine (NMGM)'s new management and jointly coordinated the independent assessment of the mine.

MMTC-PAMP appointed Synergy Global Consulting (Synergy), an independent third-party to perform an assessment of the mine. The report of the assessment was finalized at the end of May 2020. MMTC-PAMP joined the on the ground assessment carried out by Synergy, as part of its due diligence process. Unfortunately, the Covid-19 pandemic delayed the finalization of this report by several months.

The independent assessment has confirmed MMTC-PAMP's decision to continue to source from the mine. MMTC-PAMP will continue to engage with Barrick on the mitigation of the risks identified at the mine, as well as regularly update its senior management and take action if and when required. Synergy's full independent assessment report has been submitted to the LBMA.

MMTC-PAMP has published last week a statement on the matter and attached the executive summary of the Synergy report.

MMTC-PAMP has also published its audited annual report on its compliance with the LBMA Responsible Gold Guidance.

Kind regards,

**Olivier Demierre** 

Note: PAMP/MMTC-PAMP has not to date provided a response to the questions set out in RAID's letter of 15 May 2020.

RAID Correspondence to Mr Schnyder 16 November 2019 to 03 July 2020

From: Anneke Van Woudenberg < Subject: Meeting with RAID in North Mara Date: November 16, 2019 at 8:18:01 AM GMT



Dear Jay,

I am reaching out to you as Hitesh mentioned that you will be in North Mara as part of the visit of the independent assessment happening next week. My colleague, Michael Elliot, the Legal and Policy researcher at RAID, will be there the entire week of November 18<sup>th</sup>. I very much hope you will make some time to meet with him. I have copied him on this message so you have his email. He can also be reached on **Contract of Sector**.

As you may have seen from the exchange of correspondence with MMTC-PAMP since June 2019, we strongly believe that MMTC-PAMP do not have the full picture of the human rights situation at the North Mara gold mine. We would welcome an opportunity to discuss with you the findings of our many years of research and answer any questions you might have. We can also facilitate a meeting with some of the victims so you can hear from them yourself. The modalities of such meetings can be further discussed when you meet with Michael.

Please could you let us know a date and time for the meeting in North Mara? Michael can come to a meeting at the mine site if required.

We look forward to hearing from you.

Best regards,

Anneke

Anneke Van Woudenberg Executive Director

**Rights and Accountability in Development (RAID)** <u>www.raid-uk.org</u> | Twitter: <u>@raidukorg</u>

From: Anneke Van Woudenberg < Control of Subject: Re: Meeting with RAID in North Mara Date: November 22, 2019 at 11:19:22 AM GMT To: Jay Schnyder < Control of Subject: Solution Soluti

Dear Jay,

We are disappointed to not have met you when you were in North Mara this week, but welcome an opportunity to meet with you in another location. Can you let us know your availability over the coming weeks?

With my best regards,

Anneke

Anneke Van Woudenberg Executive Director

**Rights and Accountability in Development (RAID)** www.raid-uk.org | Twitter: @raidukorg

From: Anneke Van Woudenbe	erg <>		
Subject: Re: Meeting with RA	ID		
Date: February 12, 2020 at 12	:40:46 PM GMT		
<b>To:</b> Jay Schnyder <	>		
<b>Cc:</b> Olivier Demierre <	>, Michael Elliot <	>, Hitesh Kalia <	>

Dear Jay,

Just reaching out to you again as sadly we have no yet had an opportunity to meet. We would very much appreciate the chance to further discuss your visit to North Mara last November, the independent assessment that has been conducted and possible further actions that will be taken. Can you let me know your availability for a meeting in the coming weeks either in person or over the phone?

You may have seen that earlier this week a group of seven Tanzanian human rights victims launched a legal claim at the British High Court against subsidiaries of Barrick Gold, alleging serious abuses by security forces, including local police, employed at the North Mara gold mine. The case has been brought by law firm Hugh James. You can find further information <u>here</u>. I very much hope this will be part of the consideration that MMTC-PAMP and MKS use as part of its assessment.

I look forward to hearing from you.

Best regards, Anneke